BALCANICA
XXXIX (2008)
ANNUAL OF THE INSTITUTE FOR BALKAN STUDIES

Editor
DUŠAN T. BATAKOVIĆ

Editorial Board
FRANCIS CONTE (Paris), DJORDJE S. KOSTIĆ, LJUBOMIR MAKSIMOVIĆ, DANICA POPOVIĆ,
GABRIELLA SCHUBERT (Jena), BILJANA SIKIMIĆ, ANTHONY-EMIL
TACHIAOS (Thessaloniki), NIKOLA TASIĆ (Director of the Institute for Balkan
Studies), SVETLANA M. TOLSTAJA (Moscow)

BELGRADE
2009
Clothing as a Symbol of Charity and Soul Salvation in Late Medieval Kotor (Cattaro)

Religious practices in late medieval Kotor included charitable acts of donating clothes to the poor as a form of *imitatio Christi*. The model of charity for the faithful to follow was set in the vitae of widely-favoured saints such as Sts Martin of Tours, Francis of Assisi and Catherine of Sienna, whose portraits were painted on the walls of Kotor’s church of St Anne in the second half of the fifteenth century. Evidence for the practice and purpose of this particular form of charity is found in the surviving wills of the citizens of Kotor. Apart from giving clothes to the poor out of concern *pro remedio animae*, the motif of clothes features in the deceased’s testamentary instructions for burial in the habit of a mendicant order.

**Keywords:** caritas, Kotor (Cattaro), the poor, wills, clothing, saints, stigmatization, *imitatio Christi*

Two Christian concepts — poverty and charity, assumed their full notional, symbolical and practical significance in late medieval Roman Catholic religiosity. *Caritas*, the greatest Christian virtue, was manifested in public life in founding community institutions for the care of the poor, while individual believers expressed their concern for the *pauperes Christi* and other marginal groups mostly through their bequests. Giving clothes to the poor was a widespread form of charity, inspired by the example set by the saints who were highly revered at the time, such as St Martin of Tours, St Francis of Assisi and St Catherine of Siena whose fresco portraits were painted in the church of St Anne in Kotor, a coastal town in modern Montenegro, in the second half of the fifteenth century. The analysis presented here of the significance of clothing as a symbol of charity and soul salvation in the religious practice of the late medieval inhabitants of Kotor is based on the written sources (wills) and the painted decoration of the church of St Anne.

Though posited in the Bible, the concept of charity did not receive its doctrinal formulation and codified implementation in Catholic practice until the emergence and activity of the Franciscan order in the thirteenth century. According to Matthew 25:35–40, there are six “works of mercy”: the care of the hungry, of the thirsty, of strangers, of the naked, of the sick and of the imprisoned. In the thirteenth century, this list was expanded to include a seventh moral requirement: to bury the dead. On the Day of Judgement the righteous shall stand at the right hand of the King in glory: “For I was an hungered, and ye gave me meat: I was thirsty, and ye gave
me drink: I was a stranger, and ye took me in: I was naked, and ye clothed me: I was sick, and ye visited me: I was in prison, and ye came unto me.” Christ describes almsgiving as one of the three pillars of a righteous life, along with fasting and prayer (Mt 6:1–18). As a source of heavenly reward, almsgiving should be selfless and unobtrusive, because it is Christ himself that we encounter in our fellowmen in need (Mt 6:2–4; 25:31–36). It is important to note that Christian teaching does not see almsgiving merely as an act of love for man; it should be a religious act. Serving the poor reflects one’s love of Christ. By helping the poor one helps Christ himself, whose coming in glory is awaited. Caritas is therefore interpreted as the love that unites man to God, at once amor Dei and amor proximi. This teaching brings love of God into closest connection with compassion and care of the neighbour.¹ The groundwork for the medieval interpretation of the theological and cardinal virtues was laid down by Thomas Aquinas. The greatest of all virtues, caritas, was likened to an ever-burning flame. From St Francis and the example set by his lifestyle, the ascetic principle of poverty and the honouring of the principle of charity in everyday life became a widely accepted Christian imperative. From the thirteenth century, poverty and charity were given a strong impetus in the teaching and practice of the Catholic Church. In keeping with the new moral values exemplified by St Francis, St Bonaventure highlighted the virtue of caritas, describing it as light and a burning flame.²

With the founding of the mendicant orders, the development of their theology, and their great success among the laity, caritas began to be exercised in an organized way in the everyday life of medieval townships. The Church oversaw and directed the flow of material aid intended for the poor of Christ, distributing it mostly through fraternities and hospitals. The widespread practice of almsgiving stemmed from the fact that, in addition to masses for the dead and indulgences, acts of charity were believed to be instrumental in bringing about the salvation of the soul. The

¹ Synonymous with almsgiving is the Greek term eleemosyne, which initially denoted divine mercy or human compassion for one’s neighbours, and later assumed the meaning of material aid and almsgiving, cf. Vocabulaire de théologie biblique, ed. X. Léon-Dufour (Paris 1962), also available in English (Dictionary of Biblical Theology).

² In the visual arts caritas is usually shown as a female figure holding in one hand a flame, a candle or a burning heart offering it to God as a symbol of love, and in the other a bunch of flowers or a fruit basket symbolizing profane love and earthly mercy; caritas is also shown as a mother breastfeeding two babies, cf. A. Woodford, “Medieval Iconography of the Virtues. A Poetic Portraiture”, Speculum 28/3 (1953), 521–524; M. Meiss, Painting in Florence and Siena after the Black Death. The Arts, Religion and Society in the Mid-Fourteenth Century (Princeton 1978), 114–116; J. Hall, Dictionary of Subjects and Symbols in Art (Icon Editions, 1979), 64.
Golden Legend lists four possible ways of saving the souls of the dead from purgatorial tortures: prayers offered by the living, almsgiving, masses, and fasting. The understanding of the earthly life of Christians as peregrinatio, the stage of their journey during which they were to become deserving of eternal life, implied honouring the moral principle of charity. Thus, salvation required going beyond the spiritual realm in order to address practical human needs in the way required by caritas. The believer was instructed how to live a proper Christian life by a sort of guides to that earthly pilgrimage. For that reason, there was a hierarchy of charitable acts as well as the proper times to do them. Although one was expected to do charity throughout one’s lifetime, posthumous gifts seem to have been the most frequent form of charity. According to theologians, the spiritual value of a charitable act decreased as death drew nearer. It was only through renouncing one’s worldly possessions in one’s lifetime that one could fulfil the true meaning of caritas. To give away money posthumously, i.e. when it was of no use to the giver, was as good as worthless. The Golden Legend quotes St Augustine’s reflections on deathbed repentance, and his distinction between repentance prompted by the fear of death and punishment, and repentance out of love of God. Only those who lived a repentant life could be confident of their salvation.

The vita of St Elizabeth of Hungary included in The Golden Legend interprets the work of charity done in one’s lifetime as the vita activa, prototypically led by Martha, but noting that an exemplary Christian life should also involve prayer or the vita contemplativa, such as was led by Mary.

In late medieval Kotor charity was highly organized in institutional terms, ranging from individual bequests to the charity work of fraternities and hospitals. In addition to bequests of money for liturgical commemoration, the citizens of Kotor bequeathed money and other property to charity — for the poor, hospitals, lepers, orphans, or for poor girls’ dowries. These post-mortem gifts should be seen as reflecting the mores of the time and place rather than the free choice of medieval man. The will was a codi-

---

3 J. de Voragine, The Golden Legend (Princeton University Press, 1993), vol. 2, 282–287. It is interesting to note that the will of a citizen of Kotor, Fr Petar Gizda, guardian of the monastery of St Francis Outside the Walls, dated 1400, referred to The Golden Legend as “unus liber voraginis” in his rich library. The inventory made after his death included the books found in his cell (33 in personal ownership and 14 monastic), see D. Medaković, “Prilozi istoriji kulture u Boki Kotorskoj”, Spomenik SAN CV (1956), 19; R. Kovijančić, Kotorški medaljoni (Belgrade 1980), 155–156.


5 Ibid., 311. On living an exemplary Christian life in accordance with the virtue of caritas, see R. N. Swanson, Religion and Devotion in Europe, c. 1215 – c. 1515 (Cambridge 1995), 191–234.
fied public document of judicial-notarial nature combining the testator’s personal need to do charity with the rules and expectations of the Church and the community. Drawn up under the shadow of death, the wills clearly reflected the testators’ hope that their charity, which was expected from them as a principle they were inculcated with all their lives, would help them on their path to salvation.

Analysis of the wills drawn up in Kotor gives not only an idea of the economic situation of the citizens and inheritance customs and rights, but also of many aspects of the testators’ religiosity. In addition to the belief in the effectiveness of charitable acts, prayers and memorial masses, the wills vividly reflect the testators’ belief in the intercession of particular patron saints as well as their trust in particular priests, religious orders and churches. The content and form of the wills depended on the testators’ socio-economic and professional status, but they were also gender-dependent. What they have in common is the obligatory bequest of money to various charitable purposes, while the value of bequests depended on individual circumstances. These various bequests to charity included gifts of rash or some other cloth, or gifts of money for providing clothing for the poor, the sick and the lepers. The citizens of Kotor usually stated the reason for the charitable gifts: *pro remedio animae*. What makes two wills from the first half of the fifteenth century stand out is the number of charitable and other bequests. The last will of Marin Druško, a very rich and influential citizen of Kotor of humble birth, was drawn up in 1438. Apart from the standard formulaic phrases and instructions, the will contains some intimate and quite distinctive bequests, which makes it a particularly useful source in studying the complex question of the manifestation of piety in the late middle ages. The opening of the will reads: *Sr. Marinus de Druscho de cataro per dei gratiam sanus mente loquele et intellectu licet corpore lancedere sed sua facta ordinate relinquere*, while the reason for drawing up the will was the testator’s concern for the salvation of his soul: *Et volens saluti sue animae providere suum ultimum testamentum et suam ultimam voluntatem in hune modum condidit et ordinavit*. The testator recommends his soul to the Creator and His glorious mother Virgin Mary and St Michael the Archangel and the whole celestial court (*Primo recomandans animam suam altissimo conditori et sue gloriose matri Virgini Marie et sto Michaeli archangelo et toti curie celesti*), and beseeches the poor to pray for his soul: *Rogans dictas pauperes personas de rogent deum pro anima sua*. Firmly believing in the effectiveness of their prayers, he leaves them money so as to relieve their poverty. Among other charitable bequests is his instruction to clothe thirty paupers in rash (*Item ordinavit vestiri triginta pauperes personas de rassia pro anima sua*).6 According to a court rul-

---

6 *Istorijski arhiv Kotor, Sudsko-notarski dokumenti* [Historical Archives, Kotor, Court-Notarial Documents] (hereafter IAK SN) V, 821–823. The document is published in
ing of 1440, the executors of the will of Radula, widow of a Marin Simonov, were to allot part of the income from the bequeathed vineyard to the lepers living in Šuranj near the Franciscan monastery just outside Kotor’s southern gate (extra portam Surane). Another portion of the income was intended for the hospitals of the Holy Cross and the Holy Spirit. Radula’s gift to the lepers and the two hospitals included wine vessels, barrels, and the money for their clothes (pro eorum vestimentis). In 1550, Petruša, a Franciscan tertiary, bequeathed fine rash cloth (rasa sutil) to the tertiary sisters dwelling near the church of St Michael. In 1505, Trifon, son of the late Tomasius Grubonja, left the money for clothing six paupers.

For its clear and understandable message, the motif of donating clothes was frequently used in sermons, hagiography and religious painting. In the context of the late medieval system of beliefs, both the secular costume and the monastic habit were symbols of charity and salvation closely connected with the veneration of relics, with the way of life and visionary experiences of monks and ascetics, and with funerary practices. In addition to its basic material meaning, clothing had a complex spiritual one. In the saints’ visions, it symbolized a charitable gift and heavenly reward. The belief that the charitable acts of giving clothes to the poor were soul-saving was a two-way street and involved both the giver and the recipient. The example for charity was shaped in the lives of the medieval saints who enjoyed particular popularity among the faithful. Thus, in the second half of the fifteenth century, images of St Martin of Tours, St Catherine of Siena and St Francis of Assisi were painted in the town church of St Anna. On the eastern wall near the main altar are the portraits of St Catherine and St Martin along with the votive fresco inscriptions by the donors Katarina and Maruša, while the southern wall shows St Francis Receiving the Stigmata pulled out of its narrative context and shown as a separate scene with a manifest theological meaning. What connects the three saints is an analogous episode from their lives. The model of St Martin giving his cloak (paludamentum) to a poor knight was later revived in hagiography, especially from the founding of the Franciscan and Dominican orders. Christ in the figure of a naked pauper begging for clothes

---


7 IAK SN VI, 617, 618.


9 IAK SN XXIV, 758.
came to symbolize earthly charity as a requirement for deliverance of the soul from purgatorial tortures and eternal suffering. It was this connection, now beginning to be established, between the almsgivers and the *pauperes Christi* that was developed in the vitae of the contemporary saints, especially St Francis and the prominent Dominican and Franciscan tertiaries Sts Catherine of Siena and Elizabeth of Hungary respectively. In their visions Christ appeared as a poor man to whom each gave a piece of her clothes, which provided clear guidelines for the faithful. The vitae also contain descriptions of divine appearances involving the habits of the religious orders to which the saints belonged. The usual symbolic meaning of the monastic habit as a path to salvation was expanded to include secular dress, which became a symbol and object of charity. Symbolically, by renouncing the inherited secular dress and taking a religious habit instead, St Francis renounced his worldly life and embarked on a new one. In the asceticism of St Francis, poverty and charity are emphasized as central virtues. Many episodes from the life of the founder of the Franciscan order reflect the idea of *caritas* and are interpreted as a series of steps leading to his final conversion. The ascetic life of St Francis set the example, and St Bonaventure, in his *Apolo gia pauperum*, upheld and harmonized with the official doctrine of the Church the concept of *nudissima paupertas* as a Franciscan vow and ultimate moral principle. According to Bonaventure, several events were conducive to St Francis’s decision to renounce the material world and devote his life to God. All of them symbolized *caritas*, from the initial one, giving his father’s property to a poor priest of the church of San Damiano, to his giving his cloak to a poor knight and his visit to the lepers. The principal tenets of Franciscan ideology are presented in the *Legenda maior* in word, and in the Upper Church at Assisi, in image. This extensive and well-thought-out iconographic programme affirmed a compact ideology, which was of utmost importance for the spread of Franciscan teaching and for the role of the order within the Church. The scene showing St Francis giving his cloak to a poor man comes as second in the cycle painted at Assisi and is emphasized as the initial stage of the saint’s spiritual growth. The connection established between this charitable act of the saint and God’s reward is emphasized in the *Legenda maior* where, the same as in Assisi, the episode is followed by the Dream of the Palace, i.e. the reward for St Francis’s compassion for the poor knight. In his *Vita secunda*, Thomas of Celano, another biographer of St Francis, recorded as many as seven episodes of the saint’s giving away his clothes to the poor. In addition to clothing as a caritative symbol, one of the episodes emphasizes the symbolism of clothing (i.e. religious habit) as a relic. Namely, asked by
a friar minor to give him his tunic, probably wanted as a relic, St Francis gave it away and remained naked in the cold.\textsuperscript{10}

The motif of clothing used to symbolize a charitable gift occurs in several episodes from the life of St Catherine of Siena too. In a street of her hometown the Dominican tertiary was approached by a half-naked man begging for clothes. That night Christ appeared in her dream in the figure of the very same beggar. From the wound in his chest he took and returned to her the clothes she had given him the day before. This gift, invisible to others, was meant as a promise of the heavenly reward she was going to be given for her charity. In another of her visions, Catherine of Siena was symbolically shown her future life of devotion through being given a choice of one of the habits offered by Sts Dominic, Francis and Augustine.\textsuperscript{11}

The presence of the portrait of St Catherine of Siena in a church in Kotor testifies to the veneration of this Dominican saint in medieval times. Even before she was canonized in 1461, her cult was fostered by the Dominican Observants of Venice, which had become the suzerain of Kotor in 1420.\textsuperscript{12} In the context of the issue discussed here, it should be noted that the saint’s relic enshrined in the Dominican church of St Nicholas in Kotor was in fact a piece of her clothes.\textsuperscript{13} The presence of this relic undoubtedly reflected the trends in Kotor’s religious life and the prominent role that charitable activities played in it. St Catherine promoted them by setting an example, of which we can learn from several events described


\textsuperscript{11}On the role of donating clothes in the creation of medieval devotional practices and the example of St Catherine of Siena in particular, see C. Warr, “Clothing, Charity and Visionary Experience in Fifteenth-Century Siena”, \textit{Art History} 27/2 (2004), 187–211.

\textsuperscript{12}On the development of the cult of St Catherine of Siena, see A. Vauchez, \textit{Sainthood in the Later Middle Ages} (Cambridge 1997), 87–88, 209–219, 385 and passim. The fact that the cult of this local saint began to spread from the early 15th century, prior to her canonization, has not been taken into account in dating her fresco portrait in Kotor, where she is shown haloed and designated in the identifying inscription as saint, cf. V. Živković, “Freske iz XV veka u kotorskoj crkvi Svete Ane. Ikonografska analiza”, \textit{Zograf} 28 (2000–2001), 133–138.

in her hagiography. Her mysticism and visionary experiences powerfully influenced the development of her cult in Kotor as well. It should be noted that she belonged to a lay order which was very active in religious and everyday life in Kotor in the fourteenth, fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. That is why her portrait at St Anne’s in Kotor should be seen as evidencing the religious practice of the tertiaries, which amply relied on the principle of *caritas*. By founding the third order for lay men and women, the Franciscans and Dominicans put the central idea of their teaching into practice. The mendicant orders promoted a new form of religiosity which was meant to be closer to the faithful keen on expressing their piety in an established and ecclesiastically accepted form. The foundations for the emergence of tertiaries had been laid by St Francis. He developed the *triple militia* model consisting of the first and second orders for friars and nuns respectively, and the newly-founded third order for lay persons. Female tertiaries living a semi-monastic life are found in Kotor quite early, in the first half of the fifteenth century, under the name *bizokas*.¹⁴ Kotor’s later fifteenth- and sixteenth-century sources use more frequently the Venetian term *piçocara*.¹⁵ The pious women who opted for a semi-monastic way of life had the opportunity to structure their everyday life round markedly pious activities. In practice, that meant that most of them engaged in charity work at hospitals, at shelters for the poor and at orphanages, and practised needlework (usually embroidery and lace-making). The Dominican and Franciscan models of charitable work, mysticism and asceticism offered to lay women were two canonized tertiaries, St Catherine of Siena and St Elizabeth of Hungary respectively.

The manner in which St Catherine was portrayed at St Anne’s may be the reason for looking at yet another theological meaning of charity. St

---


¹⁵ The same as the Italian *piçocara*, those in Kotor had the status of tertiaries, i.e. they were affiliated to the Franciscan or Dominican orders. In other European countries, these pious women were not necessarily affiliated to a religious order. On the female religious and monastic movement in medieval Europe, and especially on the beguines, see C. Opitz, “Life in the Late Middle Ages”, in *A History of Women in the West*, ed. C. Klepisch-Zuber (Harvard University Press, 1992), 305–317. For the influence of women on religious life and the origin and expansion of the beguines, see R. W. Southern, *Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages* (London 1979), 309–331; C. Walker Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast. The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (University of California Press, 1988), 17–20, and passim; M. H. King, *The Desert Mothers Revisited: The Mothers of the Diocese of Liege*, http://www.peregrina.com/matrologia_latina/DesertMothers2.html (accessed 25/01/2007).
Above: Virgin enthroned and St Francis receiving the stigmata, Church of St Anne, Kotor

Right: St Martin of Tours, Church of St Anne, Kotor

Far right: St Catherine of Siena, Church of St Anne, Kotor
Catherine is shown with the stigmata, of which golden flames on her feet remain today. The southern wall of the church shows St Francis at the moment of receiving the stigmata. Franciscan and Dominican theologians, and the biographers of the saint whose body showed the Lord’s wounds, promoted the idea about a special connection between the stigmata and the virtue of caritas. In late medieval theology caritas was interpreted as a form of imitatio Christi. The affirmation of devotions to the body and blood of Christ, i.e. to his human nature and corporality, found its full expression in a cult closely related to devotion to the Host and the dogma of transubstantiation. Devotion to Christ’s five wounds (quinquepartium vulnus) formed part of Christocentric piety and the concept of imitation of Christ, particularly fostered from the time of St Francis. How strong if not central the idea of caritas was in the teaching of St Francis is shown by Thomas of Celano, who lists three spiritual gifts: divine love (caritas), almsgiving (amor proximi), and sinlessness, which are also seen as symbolizing the three pairs of seraphic wings from which St Francis received the marks on his body.

The connection between giving clothes to the poor and receiving the stigmata is observable in the religious practice of medieval Kotor as well. A remarkable testimony to attaching a religious significance and imitatio Christi symbolism to an individual act of charity can be found in a document from the end of the fifteenth century. In his will drawn up in 1496, Luka, son of the late Marin Bolica, bequeathed money for clothing five paupers di vestimenti di rasica in honour of Christ’s five wounds. This is a valuable source, rare in its explicit demonstration of a form of religiosity which was characteristic of late medieval Catholicism.

Apart from the underlying idea of charity, the episodes from the lives of St Francis and St Catherine of Siena about their giving clothes to the poor carried yet another meaning connected with concern for the salvation of the soul. Namely, the garb of religious orders, especially Franciscan and Dominican, had funerary and eschatological significance for the faithful. The practice of burying lay persons in the habit of a mendicant order became a favoured expression of concern pro remedio animae. This post-mortem expression of penitence was encouraged by the Church. Under the thirteenth-century popes Urban IV, Clement IV and Nicholas IV, those who chose to be buried in the Franciscan habit were granted the

---

16 For the iconography of the surviving frescoes at St Anne’s, see Živković, “Ikonografska analiza”, 133–138.
17 For the symbolism of the scene of the Stigmatization of St Francis, see Meiss, Painting in Florence and Siena, 120.
18 IAK SN XXIV, 734.
remission of one third of their sins. In the following century, Alexander VI and Leo X extended this practice to include the women buried in the Clarissan habit, while John XXII granted five-year indulgence to anyone who should kiss the Franciscan habit. From the fifteenth century on, it was not uncommon for a person to express the last wish to be buried in the habit of a mendicant order. The examples come from Kotor’s partly processed archival material dating to the early years of the fifteenth century. In his will dated 1503, Marko, son of the late Luka Pelegrin, chose the Franciscan Observant church of St Bernardino of Siena at Kotor as his burial place and instructed that he be buried in the Franciscan habit. Drawn up in 1504, the last will of Kata, predisegna of the sons of Zuan Buća, instructed that she be dressed in the Dominican habit and buried in the fraternity tomb in the church of St Nicholas di fiume outside the town’s north wall. The same Franciscan Observant church was to be the burial place of Katna, daughter of Dabišin Radosalić of Marcevasto. As stated in her will dated 1505, she wished to be buried in the Bernardinian habit. Kotor’s town physician Jacob de Ponte (Jacobus de Ponte or Pontanus) drew up his will in 1522. The opening paragraph commending his soul — In primis animam suam commendavit omnipotenti Deo piissimo domino nostro Jesu Christo, redemptori nostro, beatissime Dei Genetrici, Virgini Marie, beatissimis apostolis Petro e Paulo, beato Hieronymo ac beato Francisco et omnibus sanctis Dei — is followed by his instructions as to the place of burial and burial garb: in capella purissime conceptionis beatissime Virginis Marie apud sanctum Bernardium, in habitu seraphice religionis sancti Francisci.

The written and artistic sources discussed above seem to give grounds to conclude that the symbolism of clothing should be seen as having been closely connected with charity, poverty, the concept of *imitatio Christi* and funerary customs. Within the context of concern *pro remedio animae*, clothes — usually of plain rash cloth, or the habit of a mendicant order — had the spiritual significance of heavenly reward. The connection between a charitable earthly life and the salvation of the soul was inspired by the examples of favourite saints, such as St Francis of Assisi or St Catherine of Siena whose portraits were painted in a prominent place near the

---

19 On the practice of burying the dead in the religious habit, see Warr, “Clothing, Charity and Visionary Experience”, 196.

20 IAK SN XXIII, 595.

21 IAK SN XXIV, 724.

22 Ibid., 727.

altar in the church of St Anne at Kotor in the fifteenth century. On the other hand, the charity practised by these saints was an example to Kotor’s citizens in their personal devotional practices as expressed in their bequests to the poor.